
פרשת ויגש

פרק מה פסוק יד-טו

ויפל על צווארי בנימן אחיו ויבך ויבנמן בכה על צוואריו: וינשק לכל אחיו ויבך עליהם ואחרי כן דברו אחיו אהו:

רש"י

ויפל על צווארי בנימן אחיו ויבך. על שני מקדשות שעתידין להיות בְּחֶלְקוֹ שֶׁל בְּנִימִין וְסוּפֹן לְחֶרֶב: וּבְנִימִין בָּכָה עַל צוּאָרָיו. עַל מִשְׁכַּן שִׁילָה שְׁעֵתִיד לְהִיּוֹת בְּחֶלְקוֹ שֶׁל יוֹסֵף וְסוּפֹן לְחֶרֶב.

מושג

על שני מקדשות שעתידין להיות בְּחֶלְקוֹ שֶׁל בְּנִימִין... עַל מִשְׁכַּן שִׁילָה שְׁעֵתִיד לְהִיּוֹת בְּחֶלְקוֹ שֶׁל יוֹסֵף.

Translation:

On the two מקדש בתי that would be (built) in the portion of Binyomin... On the Mishkan in Shilo that would be in the portion of Yosef.

Explanation:

The Chazal that Rashi quotes reveals to us that when Yosef and Binyomin cry on each other's necks, they were crying for the Mishkan and Batei Mikdash that would be built in each other's portions and would be destroyed. They cried for this now because Yosef has just told his brothers to bring his father and the entire family down to Mitzrayim. He realized that the גלות מצרים was beginning and at that point felt the pain of not only this גלות but all the future destructions and exiles¹.

Looking in the Pasuk:

There are a number of reasons Chazal saw this prophecy hinted to in the words of the Pasuk². Either because the Pasuk tells us that Yosef cried on Binyomin's necks, צווארי בנימן, the plural hinting to the two מקדש that were destroyed³, or because Yosef both fell and cried (2) while Binyomin only cried. Additionally, we find the word צואר is used as a metaphor for the בית המקדש⁴. Finally, the fact that Yosef and Binyomin first cried now and not previously hints to the tears being for something else than the emotion of their reunion.

Musag Learning Outcomes:

Know: בית המקדש were in the portion of Binyomin and the משכן of Shilo was in the portion of Yosef. When Yosef and Binyomin meet they cry over their destruction.

Understand: Why Yosef and Binyomin cry over the חורבן precisely at this time.

Think: Examine text, singular and plural usage, compare and contrast to similar texts.

1 See note #1

2 While note #1 explained why Yosef and Binyomin would be crying about this now, we come here to explain how Chazal saw this hinted to in the words of the Pasuk.

3 See note #2

4 See note #3

NOTES

1. This understanding is taken from the פירוש יונתן who is bothered by the fact that Yosef first cries now on his brothers and not when he first reveals himself to them⁵. His explanation works well with the Targum Yonnason on the following Pasuk, when he cries on his brothers as well. The Targum explains that he was crying over future exiles. Yosef was thus moved to tears as he thought of his father's ירידה into גלות, causing him and Binyomin to cry prophetically on the חורבן בתי מקדש, חורבן המשכן בשילה וגלות העם in the future.

Another possible explanation of why Yosef and Binyomin prophesied just now about the חורבן הבית is because they realized how much had been lost in their own lives as the result of hatred between brothers. Even though they were now reunited, the years of separation and all the pain caused to Yaakov as a result could not be returned. This, unfortunately would become a pattern in Jewish history, when hatred between Jews would cause destruction of the things that are dearest to us, the Mishkan and בתי מקדש. They also realized that our relationship בין אדם להבירי would affect our relationship בין אדם למקום. If בתי מקדש would continue the result would be a loss of the Shechina dwelling within us.

2. This is the most commonly held understanding of the Chazal and Rashi. However, there is much discussion in the commentaries regarding the explanation that צוארי is plural. The basis for this understanding (other than the fact that צואר would be singular and צוארי is plural) is the Gemoroh in (טז:): מסכת מגילה which clearly states this as the correct understanding of our Pasuk:

"ויפל על צוארי בנימן אחיו", כמה צוארין הוו ליה לבנימין? אמר רבי אלעזר: בכה על שני מקדשים שעתידין להיות בחלקו של בנימין, ועתידין ליחרב. ובנימן בכה על צואריו, בכה על משכן שילה שעתידין להיות בחלקו של יוסף, ועתידין ליחרב.

Rashi on the Gemoroh rejects this understanding and instructs us to strike the words כמה צוארין היו לו from the text⁶. Rashi explains that a single neck could be referred to in the plural. Rashi brings a proof from a previous Pasuk (כז:טז) in which the word צואריו is used for a single neck.

It is possible that Rashi would understand that the plural (בתי מקדש) is a result of the double verb used for Yosef, ויפול and ויבך. We could prove this contention from the fact that the דיבור of Rashi is not only ויפל על צוארי בנימין but ויפל על צוארי בנימן אחיו ויבך, which includes both verbs.

It is also possible that Rashi understands the Chazal to be inferring from the word צואר being a metaphor for the בית המקדש as is understood by the Zohar⁷. According to this explanation that which Rashi says that he cried for the בתי מקדש two is just part of the prophecy, not inferred from the text of the Pasuk.

What is left unexplained according to Rashi is why would we refer to a neck in the plural, צוארי or צואריו and not צוארו. A beautiful explanation is supplied by the Midrash which comes to explain the Pasuk describing Eisav kissing Yaakov⁸, in which the singular צוארו is used (even though it is read as plural). The Midrash teaches:

5 Yosef does cry right before he reveals himself to them, (מהב:), ויתן את קולו בבכי (מהב:), however he does not hug them or cry on them as he does here. Therefore, explains the פירוש יונתן, Chazal understood that he must be crying over something else. A simpler explanation to this would be that his brothers were so shocked by his revelation that he felt he could not yet hug them or show any emotion towards them. He first asks them to come close, גשו נא אלי, and then explains to them how this was all Hashem's plan (פסוקים ד-יג) and that he holds nothing against them. Only then does he feel free to show open emotion. One could even explain that his show of emotion was to display how much he loved them. It is interesting to note that his brothers only speak to him after he kisses them and cries on them (you can fake a kiss, but not tears). Also interesting to note is that while Binyomin returns his emotion and cries on Yosef as well, his brothers do not.

6 כמה צוארין היו לו לבנימין - לא גרסינו, שכן דרך המקרא לכתוב צוארי לשון רבים על חלקת צואריו

7 Also צוארך זה בית המקדש היינו הא דכתיב (זה מה שכתוב) ויפל על צוארי בנימן אחיו ויבך מלמד שבכה על מקדש ראשון ועל מקדש שני see note #3

8 וַיִּרְץ עֶשָׂו לִקְרָאתוֹ וַיִּשְׁבְּקֵהוּ וַיִּפֹּל עַל-צְנָאָרוֹ וַיִּשְׁקָהוּ וַיִּבְכּוּ (לג:ד)

וירץ עשו לקראתו ויחבקהו ויפול על צואריו: צוארו כתיב, שלא הטא אלא מצד אחד, אבל גבי נשיקות חיבה שלימה כתיב ויפול על צוארי בנימין אחיו ובנימין בכה על צואריו

Eisav who did not really love Yaakov only kissed him on one side of his neck, therefore we read in the singular. However Yosef and Binyomin who fully loved each other cried on both sides of the neck, hence the plural reading.

There is, however, a problem with Rashi's opinion that צוארי is not plural. For it seems that not only the Gemoroh in מגילה has to be edited, but Rashi would have to edit at least five Chazal, found in various Midrashim, that all understand the word צוארי to be plural and to be referring to the two בתי מקדש. An example is the מדרש רבה:

ויפול על צוארי בנימין אחיו ויבך, וכי שני צוארים היו לו לבנימין אלא אמר רבי אלעזר בן פדת יוסף ראה ברוח הקודש ששני בית המקדשות עתידין ליבנות בחלקו של בנימין ועתידין ליחרב, ובנימין בכה על צואריו, ראה שמשכן שילה עתיד להעשות בחלקו של יוסף ועתיד ליחרב.

While we therefore may accept the plural understanding of צוארי (and leave Rashi's objections aside) there is still another problem. For the end of the Pasuk mentions Binyomin crying on Yosef and there the word used is צואריו which is also plural and yet Binyomin cried for only the Mishkan in Shilo! The תוספתא answers that צוארי is definitely plural, while צואריו may be plural or singular. Since the Pasuk switched from צוארי by Yosef, which is always plural, to צואריו by Binyomin, we assume the later to be singular.

We therefore offer multiple explanations as to the exact source in the Chumash text for our Musag.

3. On the Pasuk in (ד:ד) שיר השירים which reads *כְּמִגְדַל דָּוִד צִנְאָרָךְ בְּנוּי לְתַלְפִּיּוֹת*, *Your neck is like the tower of David built with turrets*, the Midrash (פסיקתא זוטרותא שיר השירים פרק ד) teaches:

צוארך, זה בית המקדש, מה צואר זה לראש ואם נהפך אין לו חיים, כך משחרב בהמ"ק נגרע קרן ישראל. מה הצואר נאה לגוף אף בית המקדש נאה לעולם. מה הצואר רוב תכשיטין בו, אף ישראל בזמן שבית המקדש קיים רוב הטובות של עולם היו להם.

On a deeper level we might suggest that just as the neck connects the body (physical) to the head (intellect, spiritual) so too the בית המקדש is the place where the Shechina resides in a physical structure, where the spiritual and physical meet, for the physical to be controlled by the spiritual.

4. Additional Questions:

- How would you explain the fact that the brothers do not cry on Yosef?
- Look at the Pesukim describing Yosef's reunion with Yaakov (מו:כט). How does it compare with Yosef's reunion with his brothers?